

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COUNCIL
HELD ON THURSDAY, 6 APRIL 2017**

COUNCILLORS

PRESENT

Bernadette Lappage (Mayor), Christine Hamilton (Deputy Mayor), Abdul Abdullahi, Daniel Anderson, Dinah Barry, Chris Bond, Yasemin Brett, Alev Cazimoglu, Erin Celebi, Lee Chamberlain, Bambos Charalambous, Jason Charalambous, Katherine Chibah, Dogan Delman, Nick Dines, Guney Dogan, Sarah Doyle, Christiana During, Patricia Ekechi, Nesimi Erbil, Turgut Esendagli, Peter Fallart, Krystle Fonyonga, Achilleas Georgiou, Alessandro Georgiou, Ahmet Hasan, Elaine Hayward, Robert Hayward, Ertan Hurer, Jansev Jemal, Doris Jjagge, Adeline Kepez, Joanne Laban, Dino Lemonides, Derek Levy, Mary Maguire, Donald McGowan, Andy Milne, Terence Neville OBE JP, Ayfer Orhan, Ahmet Oykener, Anne-Marie Pearce, Daniel Pearce, Vicki Pite, Michael Rye OBE, Toby Simon, Alan Sitkin, Edward Smith, Andrew Stafford, Claire Stewart, Doug Taylor (Leader of the Council) and Haydar Ulus

ABSENT

Ali Bakir, Nesil Cazimoglu, Lee David-Sanders, Suna Hurman, Eric Jukes, Nneka Keazor, Michael Lavender, George Savva MBE, Jim Steven and Glynis Vince

1

ELECTION IF REQUIRED OF THE CHAIR/DEPUTY OF THE MEETING

Not required.

2

THE MAYOR'S CHAPLAIN TO GIVE A BLESSING

Osma Pakos from Palmers Green Mosque gave the blessing.

3

MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS IN CONNECTION WITH THE ORDINARY BUSINESS OF THE COUNCIL

The Mayor began by saying that it was unbelievable that she was speaking to everyone at Council for the last time as Mayor. She said that the year had passed very quickly and she had been extremely busy. She also asked members to take some time to look at all the photos displayed which represented the many engagements that she had carried out in the wonderful community of Enfield.

1. Thank-yous

The Mayor thanked the officers who had worked so hard throughout the year and the directors for their support. She added that there was no “i” in team and that strength had been in how hard everyone had worked together.

The Mayor thanked her two consorts Andrew and Edward Lappage, who had contributed so enormously to her Mayoral Year, as well as the deputy mayor, her consort, her children and grandchildren and the people of Enfield for their invitations. She also added thanks to Councillors Alev and Nesil Cazimoglu, the Leader, Councillor Taylor and Councillor Neville for their support.

2. Past Engagements

February and March were months full of events including:

- The launch of the Sing to your Baby Project at Wilbury School working with the Chicken Shed Theatre. She gave a special mention to Councillor Orhan who had also attended.
- Women’s World Day of Prayer at the Salvation Army in Edmonton.
- Joining Soroptimists at a Coffee Morning for International Women’s Day in the Parish Centre at Our Lady of Mount Carmel and St George.
- Celebrating women in the arts as part of an International Women’s Day activity at the Millfield Theatre.
- Early morning breakfast meeting with the Enfield Chase Rotary Club.
- Bella Cora and Enfield Community Singers concert in Muswell Hill – celebrating and raising money for St Patrick’s Day.
- Taking part in the Central London Parade following the Enfield Float.
- Construct with Us Event at the Nightingale Academy when she and Councillor Alev Cazimoglu had taken a ride up in a cherry picker, learning about the amazing opportunities in the construction industry available to Enfield young people.
- Have a Cuppa Tea Party at the Ruth Winston House, raising awareness about dementia.
- Joining the walkers in Jubilee, Broomfield and Town Parks.
- Hosting a networking event with Enfield Racial Equality Council in the Mayor’s Parlour looking at the diversity in music in Enfield.

3. The Mayor’s Ball

The pinnacle event of the year was the Mayor’s Ball, supported by many members, large numbers of whom had given money to her charity. Donations from anyone who had not yet donated would be still welcomed. She thanked all who made the evening so enjoyable, particularly her family, many of whom had also attended the event.

4. Thanks to Sponsors

The Mayor thanked her sponsors throughout the year: Faiveley Transport, London Waste, the Synagogue Ladies Guild, the Rotary Clubs across Enfield, Enfield in Bloom, the Lions Club of Enfield, Lefkara Association, Tottenham

Hotspur Football Club, Arsenal Football Club, the Holy Family Convent, Barnfields, Lidl, Little by Little Consultants, the Cricketers, Thorntons, Opera Holland Park, the Royal Chase Hotel, and many more.

5. Enfield Sounds Great – the Mayor’s Charity

The Mayor also thanked all the many choirs, orchestras, bands and individual performers that had raised money for her charity “Enfield Sounds Great”.

She appreciated the fact that the music community of Enfield had stepped up to the challenge of raising money for both the most deprived children of the borough to enable them to have access to music and for some of the most vulnerable, suffering with dementia, to enable them to have music therapy sessions.

The Mayor felt that the charity had motivated the community of Enfield and had proved that Enfield was one community. Although there had been no tool kit or national organisation to support the charity, she felt that it had excelled every expectation.

6. Future Engagements

- **End of Year Celebration** - This will be a musical jam called Enfield Sounds Great including the song “Thank you for the Music”.
- **Gala Bingo Event**

7. Thanks to Rob Leak, retiring Chief Executive

The Mayor thanked Rob Leak for his wonderful support, for his sanguine advice and kindness. She said that he would be much missed, wished him the best of luck in his retirement and gave him an Enid Blyton book “Five go on a Strategy Away Day” to remind him of Enfield Council.

Rob Leak was given a round of applause.

8. Conclusion

The Mayor concluded by saying that she hoped that “as your Mayor I have brought to Enfield not only a sense of a strong community but of one community, one Enfield”. She wanted other boroughs to say “Enfield sounds great” and that everyone should continue to celebrate the good news that was Enfield. She said that Enfield had had “the best of her and she had had the best of Enfield”. She thanked everyone again for all their support.

Councillor Taylor Leader of the Council thanked the Mayor for her mayoral year and chairing the Council meetings with fairness and clarity. He thanked the Mayor for promoting music in the borough which would be a lasting legacy, and wished her well in the coming year.

Councillor Neville, Opposition Leader, joined in the thanks for the charring of the meetings. Councillor Neville commended the Mayor on bringing music to the fore and promoting this across the borough with schools.

The Mayor then thanked officers Asmat Hussain, Jayne Middleton-Albooye, Claire Johnson, James Kinsella, Koulla Panaretou and Penelope Williams for their help and support behind the scenes.

4 APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Savva, Keazor, Hurman, N. Cazimoglu, Vince, Jukes, Steven, Lavender and David-Sanders.

5 DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

Before inviting members to declare any interests, the Mayor asked Asmat Hussain (Assistant Director Legal and Governance) to make a short statement. A dispensation was granted to the Chamber regarding motions 10.8 and 10.10 as the topics were such that many members would need to declare a DPI, therefore it was felt that this met the criteria 32 4 (a) of impeding the transaction of the business.

6 MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 28 FEBRUARY 2017

Councillor Stewart moved an amendment to the minutes of the 28th February 2017, Councillor Ekechi seconded motion 10.4, not During as previously stated. With this change the minutes were agreed.

7 OPPOSITION BUSINESS - "THE COUNCIL'S LABOUR ADMINISTRATION ISN'T LISTENING"

Councillor Neville introduced the Opposition Business Paper:

The issues highlighted were as follows:

1. The paper set out instances which the opposition felt cumulatively add up to the paper's headline.
2. The opposition felt they had good examples but most obvious and most striking was Cycle Enfield. Councillor Neville stated residents, businesses, bus operators in fact all have made adverse comments but none have been listened to, still less properly responded to. The opposition felt that Implementation of the scheme had inflicted untold harm and inconvenience to residents and businesses alike.

COUNCIL - 6.4.2017

3. Reference was made to the A105 and the 3km (linear) barriers between The Triangle and Bush Hill Road junction being there over one month with very little work, he stated that traders had undeniably suffered serious losses and that in his view Councillor Anderson couldn't even be bothered to meet them - accounts produced, were dismissed with the arrogance of a third world dictator whose regard for the truth leaves much to be desired, to say nothing of his grasp of facts
4. Councillor Neville continued, the contract started September 16, six months on very little has been completed but he told The Standard that the scheme was one third completed. In fact a dashcam survey done last week showed less than 8% completed and operational. And for those Labour members not familiar with problem of the A105, have I got news for you. All this is about to be repeated in the even more difficult carriageway of the Hertford Road. Councillor Neville went on to say that at a recent Hertford Road call-in Councillor Anderson repeated the misstatement to his own members on OSC that the scheme was a TfL scheme. If any doubt "it's always the best policy to speak the truth unless of course you are an exceptionally good liar" but can't even acknowledge his wrong doing when residents who were there write to him after the event.
5. The opposition felt that the Council has an obligation to listen and respect the views of its residents. One resident woke up as did many others to find her road turned into one way working, not just for a couple of days but now coming up 6 weeks, and without any prior notification. Councillor Neville expressed his view that on present form, her letter emailed to all members will go either unanswered or be dismissed as just another opponent of the scheme.
6. The final issue raised on opposition business was regarding repairs to highways, and what is seen by the opposition as a lack of budget provision in capital, but a press comment issued claiming that £6m had been allocated from revenue and £1.7 from capital allocated for highway maintenance.
7. Councillor Achilleas Georgiou Deputy leader responded to the issues paper highlighting the following:
8. Majority group members hold ward surgeries every Saturday across the borough where residents can just turn up, how do you contact a conservative Councillor? We hold ward forums and Enfield Lock hold surgeries in the Park this is representative of how we run this Council. The Budget we set reflects what the residents want.
9. In the issue paper highway maintenance is mentioned, the author has his facts wrong, therefore this is dismissed straight away, Parks, he argues against himself, for PTCG, again the author needs to get his facts right, the majority party have opened up the group to reach out to everybody, not just individual groups.

COUNCIL - 6.4.2017

10. Shades of a soviet regime? The majority party Cabinet members are democratically elected by the labour group, not appointed by their leader, shades of a soviet regime reflect the party opposite.
11. Other issues highlighted during the debate were as follows:
12. Highlighted by members of the Opposition Group:
13. The opposition party stated that the labour group stifle opinion and have selected hearing, they don't want to listen to a different opinion and that it was failing residents.
14. The issues highlighted by members of the Majority Group:
15. The majority party read out an extract from a letter from Councillor Laban to the mayor of London, supporting the Cycle Enfield proposals.
16. Cllr laban raised point 14:13 personal explanation. There was cross party support on the funding but the criticism the opposition have is around public consultation.
17. At the end of the debate Councillor Neville summed up on behalf of the Opposition Group and Councillor Taylor summed up his groups response to the opposition paper recommendations which were not accepted or agreed by the majority party.
18. Following the debate, the issue was put to the vote, Councillor Alessandro Georgiou requested a roll call vote and 12 opposition councillors stood up. Councillor Erbil at this point requested that his vote is recorded as it didn't appear in the last set of minutes. Members were asked to vote on whether to approve the Majority Groups response.

For: 33

Councillor Abdul Abdullahi
Councillor Daniel Anderson
Councillor Yasemin Brett
Councillor Alev Cazimoglu
Councillor Bambos Charalambous
Councillor Katherine Chibah
Councillor Guney Dogan
Councillor Sarah Doyle
Councillor Christiana During
Councillor Pat Ekechi
Councillor Nesimi Erbil
Councillor Turgut Esendagli
Councillor Krystle Fonyonga
Councillor Achilleas Georgiou
Councillor Christine Hamilton
Councillor Ahmet Hassan

COUNCIL - 6.4.2017

Councillor Jansev Jamal
Councillor Doris Jiagge
Councillor Adeline Kepez
Councillor Dino Lemonides
Councillor Derek Levy
Councillor Mary Maguire
Councillor Don MCGowan
Councillor Ayfer Orhan
Councillor Ahmet Oykener
Councillor Vicki Pite
Councillor George Savva
Councillor Toby Simon
Councillor Alan Sitkin
Councillor Andrew Stafford
Councillor Claire Stewart
Councillor Doug Taylor
Councillor Haydar Ulus

Against: 17

Councillor Erin Celebi
Councillor Lee Chamberlain
Councillor Jason Charalambous
Councillor Dogan Delman
Councillor Nick Dines
Councillor Peter Fallart
Councillor Alessandro Georgiou
Councillor Elaine Hayward
Councillor Robert Hayward
Councillor Ertan Hurer
Councillor Joanne Laban
Councillor Andy Milne
Councillor Terry Neville
Councillor Anne Marie Pearce
Councillor Daniel Pearce
Councillor Mike Rye
Councillor Edward Smith

Abstentions: 0

**8
CHANGE IN ORDER OF BUSINESS**

Councillor Alessandro Georgiou moved and Councillor Ertan Hurer seconded a proposal under paragraph 2.2(B) of the Council procedure rules to change the order of items on the agenda so that item 10.5 be taken as the next item.

The change in order was not agreed.

17 For

33 Against
0 Abstentions

9
APPOINTMENT OF CHIEF EXECUTIVE

This item was withdrawn, and the Mayor asked Asmat Hussain (Assistant Director Legal & Governance) to read a short statement which stated the Council had not concluded recent exercises, therefore the approval of the appointment would go to the Council meeting on 10th May 2017.

10
CHANGES TO COUNCIL CONSTITUTION

Councillor Simon moved the report and Councillor Neville seconded the report.

Councillor Simon explained that the term 'Big Decisions' doesn't fit with Local Government legislation and the constitution needs to comply, the Key functions would remain.

There was a recommendation to delegate authority to the Monitoring Officer to make minor amendments to the constitution without referring every matter to full Council.

The recommendations in the report to Council were agreed.

11
CHANGE IN ORDER OF BUSINESS

Councillor Stewart moved, and Councillor Taylor seconded a proposal under paragraph 2.2(B) of the Council procedure rules to change the order of items on the agenda so that item 10.7, 10.10, 10.4, 10.9 and 10.1 were taken in that order.

The change in order was agreed.

12
MOTIONS

Motion 10.7 In the name of Councillor Joanne Laban

"The terrorist attack in Westminster on 22nd March 2017 was an attack on British democracy and our values. Enfield Council gives its upmost praise to our partners London's Emergency Services for their professionalism on the day and continued work to keep London safe. Enfield Council stands united with the Prime Minister and Opposition Party leaders in defiance against terrorism and those who seek to destroy our way of life."

Following the debate the motion was put to the vote and agreed with the following result:

For: 50
Against: 0
Abstentions: 0

Motion 10.10 In the name of Councillor Ayfer Orhan

“The Government has embarked on a schools funding formulae which if implemented will mean a real terms funding cut of £3 billion a year by 2020. In Enfield, schools will lose £28,839,090 by 2020 coming on the back of £3 million already deleted for schools improvements and government cuts to SEND funding.

The Government should recognise the strength of public feeling as parents, local Authorities and MPs up and down the country have expressed their concerns about the consequences of the funding gap in their schools.

Given the loss in funding to schools across the country, and specifically in Enfield, this Council calls upon the Government to listen to the demands of Enfield’s schools, teachers and parents, to rethink its position and provide fair funding for all schools in the borough.”

Councillor Alessandro Georgiou moved an amendment. The Mayor did not allow the amendment as it did not meet the council procedure rules.

For: 32
Against: 0
Abstentions: 17

Motion 10.4 In the name of Councillor Ahmet Oyken:

“The White Paper helpfully returns to an emphasis on affordable housing of all tenures, both rented and affordable homeownership. The government does now accept that the housing market is “broken” and so in this regard we are disappointed that the Paper did not go further. Whilst the Paper recognises the great role that Local Authorities can play in meeting the serious housing demand challenge it could and should have gone further. In particular we continue to ask for the government to allow councils to borrow against our assets which is the one measure which will truly enable a renaissance in housing building. There are different ways to do this so what I propose is we work together, meet the Minister, and agree a new deal which is right for the people of Enfield”.

For: 32
Against: 13
Abstentions: 0

DURATION OF THE TIME ALLOCATED FOR MOTIONS

The Mayor advised at this stage of the meeting that the time available for motions had now elapsed, so Council procedure rule 9 would apply.

NOTED that in accordance with Council procedure rule 9 the remaining motions lapsed due to lack of time.

Motion 10.1 In the name of Councillor Alessandro Georgiou:

“The people of the United Kingdom have voted to leave the European Union. Therefore the Council resolves that the flag of the EU should be removed from the flag pole on the civic centre premises and replaced with the Union Flag of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland.”

Motion 10.2 In the name of Councillor Alessandro Georgiou:

“This Council resolves that the National Anthem of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland should have time reserved to be sung during the beginning of each Full Council Meeting.”

Motion 10.3 In the name of Councillor Terry Neville:

“Borough residents were once again exposed to an unnecessary and pointless 24 hour strike on the London Underground in January, including the Piccadilly Line locally, which brought chaos to our capital and put extra pressure on other transport services. As with previous disputes this strike served only to inflict the maximum inconvenience and misery on hard working Londoners trying to get to and from their place of work.

The Council condemns the actions of the Transport Unions involved, and calls upon the Government to fully implement the relevant provisions of the Trade Union Act 2016 to further restrict the ability to take industrial action in the public transport sector.”

Motion 10.5 In the name of Councillor Terry Neville:

“The Council is aware that the management of the Cycle Enfield proposals post implementation has aroused considerable concerns amongst residents which have not been satisfactorily addressed, coupled with the failure to provide in this year’s capital budget (2017/18) adequate funding for highways maintenance, and other matters leads the Council to conclude that it has no confidence in Councillor Daniel Anderson as the Cabinet Member for the Environment”.

Motion 10.6 In the name of Councillor Joanne Laban

“Enfield Council believes that air quality is an important issue in our borough. However the Mayor of London’s proposal to extend the Ultra-Low Emission Zone to the North Circular is not the solution that Enfield requires. Enfield

Council agrees to seek a meeting with the Mayor to discuss his proposals and put forward alternative measures that will make a real difference to Enfield residents”.

Motion 10.8 In the name of Councillor Alessandro Georgiou

“This Council agrees that Enfield's Schools should receive fair funding from central Government compared to every other school in the U.K. The Council therefore calls upon the Cabinet and Shadow Cabinet Members for Education, Children’s Services and Protection to sign a joint letter to the Secretary of State for Education highlighting that Enfield Schools deserve fair funding.”

Motion 10.9 In the name of Councillor Yasmin Brett

“The cut to Housing Benefit for 18 to 21 year olds in Enfield is one cut too many by this Government. The young have been attacked on many fronts. This Council urges the Secretary of State for the Department of Work and Pensions, the Right Honourable Damien Green, to withdraw this cut as soon as possible.”

**13
COUNCILLOR QUESTION TIME**

1.1 Urgent Questions

There were no urgent questions.

1.2 Questions by Councillors

NOTED

1. The thirty-five questions on the Council agenda and written responses provided by the relevant Cabinet Members.
2. The following supplementary questions and responses received, for the questions indicated below:

Question 1 from Councillor Erbil to Councillor Oyken, Cabinet Member for Housing

“The number of properties is 400, this is less than the 2500 people waiting in temporary accommodation”

Reply from Councillor Oyken

“This council is against the government cuts and pressures on housing, there are 2500 properties in the pipeline and 10000 houses in planned in the next century, this administration is excited, it has been createive and we have been innovative.”

Question 2 from Councillor Neville to Councillor Taylor, Leader of the Council

“Thank you Councillor Taylor for the response, does he not accept however that an administration taking a robust view of finances would have taken the action such as was taken on the 1st March 2017 this year, last Autumn?”

Reply from Councillor Taylor

“Firstly, it is not unusual to send instructions towards the end of the financial year as a reminder, CMB also sent instructions in June and January to staff curtailing expenditure, mitigations have been taken already by officers in order to control expenditure and I can assure councillor Neville that the Cabinet members and Senior Officers are aware and take action. There is no doubt amongst staff that this is our objective and they should be doing their bit.”

Question 3 from Councillor Jiagge to Councillor Taylor, Leader of the Council

“Will the Leader indicate what other action has been taken.”

Reply from Councillor Taylor

“I met with the MP for Edmonton Kate Osamor, and she wrote to David Green. She said in her letter there has been no public consultation on the impact of the closure of the Job Centre Plus, where is the listening government? We have a high percentage of clients who attend the JCP who are in precarious situations, sometimes with mental health problems they are now being cast adrift with the decisions of this government. This is a bad decision made by a bad government.”

Question 4 from Councillor Dines to Councillor Oyken, Cabinet member for Housing.

“Will the Cabinet member give a commitment tonight that no building will be on green belt ?”

Reply from Councillor Oyken

“Resisting building on green belt is the policy of the council and has been debated previously in this chamber. One must read carefully the white paper, which is offering LA the choice, our position is to protect the green belt as it is now.”

Question 5 from Councillor Jemal to Councillor Anderson, Cabinet member for Environment.

“Can the Cabinet member tell me how trees are managed in the Borough?”

Reply from Councillor Anderson

“Trees are managed in accordance with the corporate tree strategy removing dead or diseased trees, planting new ones, benefits are reduced insurance claims with reduced number of trees being blown down, this is a very positive and proactive approach.”

Question 6 from Councillor Dines to Councillor Orhan, Cabinet member for Education, Children’s Services and protection.

“I understand the Cabinet member is not too keen on academies and free schools, but like it or not the Wren academy is a much needed secondary school for North Enfield, parents in Chase Ward have a number of questions, does the Cabinet member not feel that her and her officers should be proactively engaging with the Wren and taking a leadership role so we can let parents in North Enfield know answers to at least some of their questions?”

Reply from Councillor Orhan

“I think I have made it clear in my response to your question and I have also provided on countless occasions the same comment for the same question in the same manner. This is your government policy the decision of funding rests only with the EFA and the department for Education, may I suggest humbly to you to talk to your government. Please do me a big favour as my officers are constantly ask the government to liaise and share with us their statement and comments in terms of any new schools they intend opening in the borough, could you ask them on my behalf to talk to us so that we can give them our view, as it’s quite clear that the policy of this administration is committed to the Education of our children and increasing school capacity”

Question 7 from Councillor Maguire to Councillor Lemonides, Cabinet member for Finance and efficiency.

“Thank the Cabinet member for his response, can I ask does councillor Lemonides have any concerns about the level of borrowing?”

Reply from Councillor Lemonides

“Our borrowing levels are carefully managed the great majority of the debt relates to investments which will create a financial return or savings to the council.”

Question 9 from Councillor Dogan to Councillor Fonyonga, Cabinet member for Community Safety and Public Health.

“Can you tell us why we should use the Health kiosk, and is it called Serena after Serena Williams?”

Reply from Councillor Lemonides

“The new Health Kiosk is indeed named after Serena Williams who is indeed the greatest athlete of all times, on a more serious note to address why you should visit the kiosk, sadly this Tory government ignores concerns from residents and slashes funding to our public health budget, and so this listening labour administration prioritises the health of our residents and has provided this health kiosk free of charge to monitor their blood pressure, it is estimated that there are 31000 people in our borough that don't know their own blood pressure and as my excellent colleagues in the public health team have educated me on, high blood pressure is incredibly problematic as you may have no symptoms but it can cause heart attacks or strokes at any time. I urge everybody here to visit Serena on a monthly basis to monitor your blood pressure.”

**14
COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP**

There were no changes to Committee Memberships.

**15
NOMINATIONS TO OUTSIDE BODIES**

There were no changes to Outside Bodies.

**16
CALLED IN DECISIONS**

There were no called in decisions.

**17
DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

The date of the next Council meeting will be Wednesday 10th May 2017 this is for Annual Council and Mayor making.